

Appendix 16

Identifying the youngest children of Bostwick Tuttle

Bostwick Tuttle was the eldest son of Samuel and Thankful (née Pierson) Tuttle. On November 6, 1788 he married Luania Judd in Plymouth, Connecticut. ^{87v} They were to raise a large family, the first six children, Rensselear, Chandler, Pamelee, Esther, Susan, and Albert were all clearly identified in the Plymouth vital records. ^{87v} Following the families move to Windham, New York, there were no verifiable or direct records published for any additional children. However, the 1810 USC for Windham indicates that the Bostwick Tuttle household contained 4 subordinate males and 4 subordinate females. ⁶⁶

Presented below is very strong evidence to suggest that Bostwick and Luania Tuttle had three, rather than just two, additional children: a son Samuel born about 1801-1805; a daughter Leafy born about 1807; and a daughter Thankful born about 1810/1811 (after the 1810 USC).

~

Samuel Tuttle, in particular, has been difficult to sort out from the sparse Windham, New York records. Bostwick Tuttle's parents, Samuel and Thankful Tuttle, also came to Windham in the early 1800s. ⁶⁶ Although it is not certain, it is suspected that Bostwick Tuttle's brother, Samuel, also came to Windham in the early 1800s. So how is it possible to conclude that there was also a third Samuel Tuttle from this family line in Windham and that he was the son of Bostwick Tuttle? Two land sales in Windham, New York, provide information that sets the stage.

The first sale, while it does not conclusively establish a familial relationship, does link a Samuel Tuttle to Bostwick Tuttle. A land sale by a Samuel Tuttle to John A. Thompson occurred on January 20, 1826, and the property description includes "which Bostwick Tuttle bought of Simon Cobb and conveyed to the said Samuel [Tuttle]." **The property description further indicates that it is immediately adjacent to the Bostwick Tuttle property.** ^{ss} This strongly suggests that Bostwick and Samuel Tuttle were closely related.

The second land sale occurred on March 7, 1828 by a Samuel and Georgia Ann Tuttle ^{ss}. Inclusion of his wife and her unusual given name on the sales document, in conjunction with the census records below, establishes the age parameters of that Samuel Tuttle.

By reviewing subsequent census records, in the context of the association of Samuel and Georgia Ann Tuttle as husband and wife, it is possible to reach definitive conclusions that the Samuel Tuttle in that land transaction is not father Samuel Tuttle or his son Samuel Tuttle (Bostwick Tuttle's brother). At this point it is probable that he is the son of Bostwick Tuttle, but there are additional proofs to follow.

~

The 1840 USC for Greenfield, Huron County, Ohio lists the following:

Samuel Tuttle	1 ♂ <5; 1 ♂ 5-10; 1 ♂ 10-15; 1 ♂ 30-40	107
	1 ♀ <5; 1 ♀ 5-10; 1 ♀ 10-15; 1 ♀ 30-40	

The 1850 USC for Portland, Erie County, Ohio lists the following:

Cornelius Ryan	27	NY	117
Jerusha	24	NY	
Anna A	4	OH	
Mary	1	OH	
Samuel Tuttle (INSANE)	49	NY	

The 1860 USC for Goodland, Lapeer County, Michigan lists the following:

John Atwell	30	NY	138
Theresa	24	OH	
Ellen E.	3m	MI	
Ogden	23	NY	
Samuel Tuttle	56	CT	

The 1860 USC for Attica, Lapeer County, Michigan lists the following:

Cornelius Ryan	36	NY	139
Jerusha	34	NY	
Emma	14	OH	
Mary	11	OH	
Eugene	2	MI	
John	1	MI	
Georgeiana Tuttle	54	NY	

A Samuel Tuttle in the 1840 Huron County, Ohio census is in the appropriate age range to accommodate the Samuel Tuttle in the 1850 and 1860 census listed above. ^{107, 117, 138} The unnamed wife of the Samuel Tuttle in the 1840 Huron County, Ohio census is in the appropriate age range to accommodate the Georgiana Tuttle in the 1860 census listed above. ^{107, 139}

The census records for both 1850 and 1860 indicate that Jerusha Ryan was born in approximately 1826 in New York. ^{117, 139} The 1840 Huron County, Ohio census records indicate that Samuel Tuttle had a daughter born in the appropriate age range to accommodate Jerusha Ryan. ¹⁰⁷ In addition, the land sale record indicates that a Samuel and Georgia Ann Tuttle family were in Windham, New York in 1826 when Jerusha Ryan was born. ^{ss}

The 1860 census record for Lapeer County, Michigan indicates that Theresa Atwell was born in approximately 1836 in Ohio. ¹³⁸ The 1840 Huron County, Ohio census records indicate that Samuel Tuttle had a daughter born in the appropriate age range to accommodate Theresa Atwell. ¹⁰⁷

Jerusha Ryan had taken a Samuel Tuttle into her household in Ohio in 1850 and by 1860 Jerusha Ryan had taken a Georgiana Tuttle into her Lapeer County, Michigan household. ^{117, 139} In addition, in 1860, there is a Samuel Tuttle living nearby in the Lapeer County, Michigan household of Theresa Atwell. ¹³⁸ Considering all of the facts and circumstances, it is highly probable that Jerusha Ryan and Theresa Atwell are sisters and the daughters of Samuel and Georgiana Tuttle.

The final import of this analysis is that the Samuel Tuttle in the above census reports and the 1828 Windham land purchase are one-in-the-same person. That Samuel Tuttle was born in 1801-1805 (although it is not clear whether the birth occurred in Connecticut or New York). As a result and in light of the chronology, he is not father Samuel (born 1742/43) or Bostwick's brother, Samuel, born approximately 1770. Although we cannot say it with certainty, the birth date range (1801-1805) strongly suggests that this Samuel Tuttle is the youngest son of Bostwick Tuttle and grandson of our Samuel Tuttle (see Bostwick Tuttle, pp. ^{xx}). ^{89, 107, 117}

~

Identifying the two additional daughters of Bostwick and Luania Tuttle is more straight forward and adds another strong link to the claim that Samuel, Leafy, and Thankful are siblings.

The 1850 USC for New Haven, Huron County, Ohio lists the following:

Harmon Ransom	43	NY	xxx
Leafy	43	NY	
Silas	18	NY	
Bostwick	16	OH	
Caroline	14	OH	
Sherman	7	OH	
Marriet	5	OH	
William	1	OH	
Samuel Tuttle	49	CT	

The 1850 USC for New Haven, Huron County, Ohio lists the following:

Alvin Donehe	45	NY	xxx
Thankful	40	NY	
Burton	18	NY	
Charles	14	OH	
Prentis Palmer	14	OH	
James Palmer	9	OH	

It is important to remember that a Samuel Tuttle family was in Huron County, Ohio in 1840. It is also important to note that in 1850 there is a Samuel Tuttle (49 years of age) in the Ransom household in Huron County and a Samuel Tuttle (49 years of age) in the Ryan household in immediately adjacent Erie County, Ohio (see pp. 2). Since Samuel Tuttle was identified in the census as insane and the two local censuses were taken approximately one month apart, it is likely that the family was alternating responsibility for Samuel Tuttle and he was counted twice in the 1850 USC. And finally, it is significant that one of the Ransom sons is named Bostwick which was not a common given name.

~

The 1860 USC for Auburn, Fond du Lac County, Wisconsin lists the following:

Alvin D?????? [illegible]	54	NY	xxx
Thankful	50	CT	
Harmon Ransom	54	NY	
Levi *	53	NY	
Sherman	17	OH	
Marriet	15	OH	
William	12	OH	

Census records are almost never “perfect”, from census to census different “pet” names are reported, the names are given variant spellings, the ages are “wrong”, and/or the birth states are “wrong”. The above 1860 USC for Auburn, Wisconsin incorporates all such possibilities and even takes them one step further. Almost certainly the census taker on that day was given the name “Leafy” but heard “Levi”. Since Levi is clearly a male name, the gender for “Levi” Ransom was entered as male. This left open the possibility that “Levi” Ransom was a brother of Harmon Ransom. However, the age for “Levi” of 53 in the 1860 Auburn USC is consistent with the age of 43 for Leafy in the 1850 New Haven USC. And with the exception of our “Levi” Ransom who only once appears in the census, there are only 3 additional Levi Ransoms in the entire census for 1850 and 1860, and all 3 have been definitively eliminated as this “Levi” Ransom. All things considered, it is only reasonable to believe that “Levi” Ransom in the 1860 Auburn USC is actually Leafy Ransom, and there is no doubt that the Donehe (Donahue) and Ransom households of 1850 Huron County, Ohio merged in 1860 Fond du Lac County, Wisconsin. Immediate proximity in Ohio (1850) and the sharing of a household in Wisconsin (1860) strongly suggest that Leafy Ransom and Thankful Donahue are sisters.

The final piece of evidence is the lynchpin. A death record in Clark County, Wisconsin indicates that Thankful Donahue died June 27, 1877 *ae* 71, and indicates that she was the daughter of Bostwick and Luanni (née Judd) Tuttle. ^{103v} The death record suggests that she was born in about 1806 whereas the two census records indicate that she was born about 1810/11 (the 1810/11 birth date would explain the absence of a fifth subordinate female in the Bostwick Tuttle household in the 1810 USC). The Tuttle thread running through the Ryan, Atwell, Donahue, and Ransom families, the close ages of the three principles (Samuel, Leafy, and Thankful), and the documentable association of Thankful (née Tuttle) Donahue to Bostwick and Luanni (née Judd) Tuttle as her parents cannot be disregarded; Samuel Tuttle, Leafy (née Tuttle) Ransom, and Thankful (née Tuttle) Donahue are the children of Bostwick and Luania (née Judd) Tuttle.

Endnotes

Census Records

- 66 1810 USC, New York, Greene Co., Windham, Roll 27, pp 325
- 89 1830 USC, New York, Erie Co., Hamburg, Roll 114, pp 139
- 107 1840 USC, Ohio, Huron Co., Greenfield, Roll 404, pp 383
- 117 1850 USC, Ohio, Erie Co., Portland, M432_676, pp 61 Samuel App
- xxx 1850 USC, Ohio, Huron Co., New Haven, M432_697, pp 179 Ransom
- xxx 1850 USC, Ohio, Huron Co., New Haven, M432_697, pp 182 Donahue
- 138 1860 USC, Michigan, Lapeer Co., Goodland, Roll M653_549, pp 0, image 34
Samuel App
- 139 1860 USC, Michigan, Lapeer Co., Attica, Roll M653_549, pp 0, image 65
Samuel App
- xxx 1860 USC, Wisconsin, Fond du Lac Co., Auburn, Roll M653_1407, pp 233
joint household Ransom/Donahue

Land Records (including tax records)

- ss Windham land records bostwick 1826 sale
- ss Windham land records samuel 1828 sale

Vital Records/ Other Public Records

- 87v Plymouth, Connecticut Vital Records (Barbour Collection "Slip Index")
- 103v Clark County, Wisconsin Vital Records, Death Record Book #1, #7,
Courthouse, Neillsville, Wisconsin